



NYC 3-1-1 CITIZEN SERVICE CENTER

2005 COMPUTERWORLD HONORS CASE STUDY

GOVERNMENT & NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS

A NEW CUSTOMER SERVICE INITIATIVE FOR NEW YORK CITY ESTABLISHES A SINGLE PHONE NUMBER (3-1-1) BY WHICH RESIDENTS, BUSINESS PEOPLE AND VISITORS CAN REQUEST DIRECTORY ASSISTANCE, INFORMATION OR CITY SERVICES, A SYSTEMS INTEGRATION PROJECT UNPRECEDENTED AMONG 3-1-1 PROGRAMS ACROSS THE COUNTRY. [20055399]

A Search for New Services



SUMMARY

The Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications (DoITT) for the City of New York designed and implemented a new customer service initiative for the City that establishes a single phone number (3-1-1) by which residents, business people and visitors can request directory assistance, information or services from the City. The size and scope of the development of this complex systems integration project were unprecedented among 3-1-1 programs across the country. The project included significant organizational change, business process change and content design and collection, as well as new computers and a new system. The integrated system provides callers with more personalized service, faster problem resolution and easier access to knowledgeable help. NYC 3-1-1 offers the following services to citizens: • Provides directory assistance information about local government phone numbers, addresses or office hours • Fulfills requests for information about specific processes or publications • Accommodates requests for a broad range of services—from fixing potholes and broken street lights, to acquiring a birth certificate, to arranging for sanitation pick-up • Allows callers to report “quality of life” issues or complaints with the New York Police Department • Offers a first line of communication to citizens during large scale emergencies • Enables residents to provide an ‘Opinion to the Mayor’ about public policy issues NYC 3-1-1 has created value for governments and citizens by: • Provides cost savings through consolidation of call centers and departments and through better resource allocation • Delivers high-value outcomes in terms of open government and enabling citizens to find the information they need quickly • Reduces the number of non-emergency calls to 911; in 2003, 911 handled 255,000 less calls than the previous year, largely due to 3-1-1 During the program’s first year of operation, 3-1-1 received more than eight million calls. Today, the number of incoming calls average over 40,000 per day. The City anticipates that 3-1-1 will handle 12 million calls in the upcoming year, making it one of the largest and most sophisticated citizen service systems in the world.

Robert Carrigan,
Chairman of the Chairmen’s Committee

Ron Milton,
Vice-Chairman of the Chairmen’s Committee

Dan Morrow,
Chief Historian

APPLICATION

Shortly after assuming his position as mayor of New York City, Michael Bloomberg pledged to make “one-stop” customer service a priority for his administration. This simple goal belied a much grander vision—transforming the quality of life for New Yorkers by using technology as a conduit to more transparent and pro-active citizen service. Mayor Bloomberg summed up his intentions when he said “By introducing the 3-1-1 phone system, the City will end the frustrating bureaucracy new Yorkers encounter when they need help...I am confident that the new 3-1-1 system will vastly improve the way that New York City government functions.”

The result is “NYC 3-1-1,” one of the most ambitious and comprehensive citizen service centers ever developed by a government organization. Under the new “one-stop” service delivery model, a single, integrated communication channel manages all of the City’s non-emergency service and information requests. This enables New York City’s eight million residents to simply dial 3-1-1 on their telephones to access a wide range of city services previously delivered through 50+ separate agencies and 40 call centers.

The responsibility for developing and implementing the 3-1-1 solution fell to the New York City Department of Information Technology and Telecommunications (DoITT), which coordinated the activities of four dedicated teams and multiple hardware and software vendors. Under DoITT’s direction, these resources:

- Developed a searchable knowledge base and taxonomy of city, state and federal government services.
- Built an entirely new, integrated call center operation to house 450 citizen service representatives

and the system's supporting technology infrastructure. This infrastructure is based on Siebel Systems' Call Center application (v7) and runs on a Sun Solaris platform. Other important solution components include CTI from Genesys Telecommunications, telephony and PBX systems from Nortel, and data network routers from CISCO.

- Introduced operational processes that leverage customer contact software applications from Siebel Systems and content management tools from Interwoven.
- Integrated 3-1-1 with 122 New York Police Department precincts to help resolve "quality of life" complaints lodged over the police hotline.

DoITT launched the ambitious 3-1-1 program within just nine months. Today, all New York City residents, visitors and businesses can dial 3-1-1, anytime, to speak with a citizen service representative who can assist them with a wide range of requests in 171 languages, from Amharic to Zulu. Non-NYC residents can also access City services and information by simply dialing (212) NEW-YORK. The 3-1-1 Customer Service Initiative provides three types of service: (a) directory assistance for city services and commonly requested non-NYC jurisdictions (e.g., state and federal agencies and authorities); (b) information requests for city services; and (c) service requests for city services. The integrated system provides callers with more personalized service, faster problem resolution and easier access to knowledgeable help. Since the day it went live, the 3-1-1 system has assisted over 16 million callers in getting access to government services.

3-1-1 has also forced accountability and openness in government – a central theme of the Mayor's administration. By moving towards one centralized system that collects complaint information – including the time required to resolve an issue, as well as the actions taken by an agency – the City can analyze how it utilizes staff to respond to problems, identify trends, and proactively address problems. Since the agencies are no longer responsible for collecting complaint information, and because there is now an independent entity monitoring their response, the public can feel confident about the results it sees. And making the results public is part of 3-1-1. Working with the Mayor's Office of Operations DoITT updated the information reported in the annual Mayor's Management Report to include 3-1-1 statistics, and deployed a great deal of information through the "My Neighborhood Statistics" tool on NYC.gov. Today, the public can go online, and compare statistics in their neighborhood with that of any neighborhood around the City.

Development of the 3-1-1 initiative resulted in better utilization of existing resources through consolidation of the city's numerous and disparate call centers. The resulting effect was an improvement in all of the supporting technologies and tools used by call center staff. Based on the new consolidated model, only one set of technology infrastructure would be required to support the estimated 40,000 calls that are managed every day at 3-1-1. This also meant that full focus could be placed on supporting this technology, and creating a standard set of tools and content to ensure that 3-1-1 provides the best possible information to every caller. In addition to taking advantage of economies of scale from a management and administrative standpoint, 3-1-1 led to the creation of standard training for customer care representatives. Gone were the days when call center representatives relied upon manual notes to handle customer inquiries. 3-1-1 operators also benefited from the creation of 3-1-1. By creating a career ladder including positions such as call taker, team lead, supervisor, tour manager, and analyst positions the career of a call center representative suddenly became just that – a career.

3-1-1 represents a revolutionary change in government. It has changed the manner in which New Yorkers contact government. It has changed the manner in which agencies operate and allocate resources. And it has changed the way the public and the Mayor hold agencies accountable. With access to integrated information from millions of 3-1-1 callers, City officials are able to monitor how well agencies respond to the public. According to Gino Menchini, commissioner of DoITT and chief information officer of New York City, "We now have access to new data that enables us to make better management decisions and allocate our resources more efficiently, which translates into cost savings to the city."

BENEFITS

It has historically been extremely difficult to know where to go for help or information about New York City services. City agencies occupied 14 pages in the phone book, and the City operated more than 40 different call centers. Even people well versed in city government were stymied by the complexities of agency responsibility. For example, a tree that is blocking a street sign could be the responsibility of two different agencies. If the tree is part of a park adjacent to the street, then the Department of Parks and Recreation is responsible, otherwise it is the Department of Transportation's job to prune it.

Similarly, manhole covers that become street hazards are repaired by the Department of Transportation – unless sewer or water lines run beneath, in which case the Department of Environmental Protection is responsible. With New York City’s new 3-1-1 service, citizens no longer need to understand the complexities of the city government structure to get information or resolve a problem. New York City’s 3-1-1 service provides one simple number for people to call to access all parts of city government.

There are a variety of ways to look at the benefits and value created by the implementation of 3-1-1 in New York City.

Maximize Accessibility to Agency Information and Services

Mayor Bloomberg once said that the City spends over \$40 Billion every year on services that no one knows how to access. The main goal of 3-1-1 was to increase accessibility to government information and services in a way that is fast and easy. DoITT also wanted to ensure that the information provided at 3-1-1 was the most accurate, concise, and up to date information available – and that the information could be managed by a large number of call center staff.

To achieve this, 3-1-1 has established a service level standard of having 80% of calls answered within 30 seconds by a live person. In the first year, nearly 95% of calls were answered within 10 seconds. To ensure that content is up to date and accurate, 3-1-1 has liaisons at every City agency that focus on providing 3-1-1 with information on new services and changes to existing services, and has staff within its own organization dedicated to identifying new and changed information. 3-1-1’s internal content team monitors the media, identifies gaps in the content, analyzes how to best present the information in the system, and works with agencies to resolve complex questions that may affect multiple agencies’ jurisdiction. Agencies are also responsible for notifying 3-1-1 of events as they happen, so that the public can be provided with timely and accurate information. 3-1-1 maximizes the amount of information that can be handled by a central call taker by standardizing the content management process, and by employing easy to use tools that make information retrieval possible.

During the program’s first year of operation, 3-1-1 received an average of 20,000 calls daily. Today, the number of incoming calls average over 40,000 per day. The City anticipates that 3-1-1 will handle 12 million calls in the upcoming year, making it one of the largest and most sophisticated citizen service systems in the world. This volume increase since the initial launch of 3-1-1 has shown that more New Yorkers are now able to access government services.

Maximize Service Fulfillment Efficiency and Effectiveness

3-1-1 improves the service fulfillment of city services by keeping constituents involved in the fulfillment cycle and increasing their satisfaction and confidence in the government. Every call to 3-1-1 is given a service request number so that callers can follow up on the outcome of their request. Future enhancements will allow 3-1-1 to email callers directly with a status report on their issue.

3-1-1 has also improved governmental efficiency by replacing manual processes and paper based processes (such as NYC Police Department Quality of Life complaints) with computerized systems that record, and manage complaints and can be used as the basis to track trends and conduct advanced analysis. 3-1-1 has completely implemented new ways of doing business for some agencies. For instance, DoITT recently implemented a plan examination scheduling system for the Department of Buildings (DOB). This system has automated the process of scheduling time for building plan examinations – which has helped DOB manage its operations – and has also automated the system, which provides great value to DOB in their effort to control corruption. Automation of this scheduling process has resulted in a significant benefit for citizens as well; the lead-time required to schedule an inspection has dropped from weeks to days.

With basic agency issue-tracking capabilities in place, the City is now able to leverage the 3-1-1 system to streamline citizen interactions and address “hot” issues as they arise. For example, if calls about water pressure begin to stream in from a particular borough, it may indicate water line damage. The City can quickly analyze geographic data and take appropriate action. As another example, potholes are a common problem on City streets after severe winter weather. Thanks to 3-1-1, as complaints about potholes come in, the system quickly determines which holes are generating the most concerns and enables the dispatch of repair crews to those locations right away. Since the 3-1-1 service launch, the Department of Transportation has been able to respond to pothole complaints in seven days—versus an average of 18 days prior to 3-1-1. In addition, the backlog of pothole complaints has dropped by 66 percent.

Maximize Impact of Service Delivery

The data collected from the 3-1-1 Customer Service Initiative provides feedback to city administrators to allow them to appropriately manage and triage the resources of the government in the most effective manner. Voluntary feedback provided by citizens identifies areas of strength, weakness, and possible improvement. The 3-1-1 program increases the number of ways government can improve and affect New York City residents' lives. 3-1-1 also allows New York City to respond to large fluctuations in public service needs, crisis scenarios and special short-term programs, increasing the amount of health, safety, and awareness delivered to the citizen.

New York City government is also seeing other benefits from 3-1-1 beyond the efficient delivery of services. New York's 3-1-1 service is helping to transform government itself by providing rich insights into how the City is performing. With the robust data collected from 3-1-1 calls, the City can, for the first time, apply performance metrics to determine how quickly it responds to specific citizen concerns. 3-1-1 provides access to new data that enables New York City leaders to make better management decisions and allocate resources more efficiently.

3-1-1 enables New York City to gather, store and analyze information about what is happening: how many called and about what? How did the responsible agency respond and how quickly? Because of the computer database at the heart of 3-1-1, DoITT can now put together all those individual bits of data, like pieces of a jigsaw puzzle, until the bigger picture is visible. Then the City can use that information to get better every day—to make government even more open, more accountable and more responsive to New Yorkers.

Optimize City Administrative Burden

3-1-1 reduces duplication in effort resulting from jurisdictional discrepancies (two or more agencies possibly responding to the same complaints). It also reduces the amount of burden placed on each agency in managing customer service and providing basic information.

On the more macro level, 3-1-1 is able to deliver cost savings through consolidation of call centers and technologies. Operating a single call center for all customer needs is far more efficient than many agency-based centers throughout the city. Standardizing on a core set of application and telephony technologies minimizes support costs and allows the City to develop core skills as well as leverage buying power of the City.

Maximize Public Safety

Before 3-1-1, many non-emergency calls—especially late night ones—were being handled too often by 911 emergency services, needlessly burdening emergency personnel whose efforts really should have been focused on life-safety needs. Nationwide, 35% of calls to emergency 911 systems are not emergencies. 3-1-1 has provided a significant benefit in this area. Last year, for the first time in 15 years, the volume of calls to 911 in New York City decreased, by about a quarter of a million calls – largely due to 3-1-1.

The 3-1-1 system has also been instrumental in providing services to citizens during emergency situations. During the 2003 blackout, 3-1-1 handled over 175,000 calls through the weekend. The system was again relied upon during the Staten Island Ferry Crash, and again during a recent 911 outage. 3-1-1 has since developed tools to be used in times of emergency to assist with Police Department and Medical Examiners Office in the tracking of missing persons. As the City has become reliant on the active role 3-1-1 plays in an emergency, operational protocols have been established that define the way the technological tools and staff at 3-1-1 are utilized in an emergency situation. The 3-1-1 service has convincingly demonstrated New York City's commitment to delivering comprehensive services to citizens even under the most challenging of conditions.

IMPORTANCE

The innovative and technically sophisticated system comprises hardware, software and services from leading technology vendors, including Accenture, Cisco, Genesys Telecommunications Laboratories Inc., Information Methods Inc. (IMI), Interwoven, iXP Corp, Motorola, Nortel, Oracle, SDG Corp., Siebel Systems, Inc., Sun Microsystems, Verizon, and Winbourne & Costas. Together, these teams:

- Developed a searchable knowledge base and taxonomy of City, state and federal government

services. By using enterprise content management technologies to feed information into a customer relationship management tool from Siebel Systems, DoITT established the basic structure of information that enabled citizen service representatives to respond quickly to callers' questions. The result: a comprehensive repository of information on more than 7,000 aspects of the City's government.

- Built an entirely new, integrated call center operation to house up to 450 citizen service representatives. This facility is also home to the 3-1-1 project's supporting technology infrastructure, which is based on Siebel Systems' Call Center application (v7) and runs on a Sun Solaris platform. Other important solution components include CTI from Genesys Telecommunications, telephony and PBX systems from Nortel, and data network routers from CISCO. The 45,000 square foot operations center and accompanying technology backbone have proven capable of handling over 10 million calls a year—or three times the volume of calls managed by the next largest city call center in Chicago.
- Introduced a host of new operational processes that leveraged customer contact software applications from Siebel Systems and content management tools from Interwoven. The integration of Siebel and Interwoven was critical in fulfilling the City's 3-1-1 vision. Through Interwoven's enterprise content management platform and its Connector for Siebel eBusiness Applications, users can aggregate, create, categorize and publish content to Siebel, such as FAQs, literature, and other information about agencies and the services they provide. This means citizen service representatives have a single point from which to create, manage, approve and deploy content to Siebel applications. This greatly improves the management and delivery of content, while ensuring the delivery of consistent information to the City's call center applications, as well as to the City's website.
- Rolled out 3-1-1 workstations to more than 100 New York Police Department precincts to help resolve "quality of life" complaints lodged over the police hotline. With this unique solution component, DoITT networked all 122 of the City's police precincts to the 3-1-1 system's database. A citizen service representative can now automatically route appropriate non-emergency calls to a specific precinct's computer. This allows the police to analyze problems more quickly and determine the most effective response.

DoITT launched the 3-1-1 service within just nine months of the mayor announcing his vision of more accessible government. Today, 3-1-1 provides a single point of entry to City government for all residents, visitors and businesses. Key City hotlines consolidated under 3-1-1 include those of the Departments of Transportation, Records and Information Services, Sanitation, Consumer Affairs, Housing Preservation and Development, and Employment. New York City residents can dial 3-1-1 anytime, day or night, to speak with a citizen service representative who can assist them with a wide range of service requests and information in 171 languages, from Amharic to Zulu. Non-NYC residents can also access the system by simply dialing (212) NEW-YORK.

ORIGINALITY

In 1997 the FCC mandated '3-1-1' be available to municipalities as a means of quick access to non-emergency police and other government services. Mayor Bloomberg built upon the idea of 3-1-1, which a few other cities had already begun to implement, and took it further – expanding its focus to truly address customer service and ease of using government. When Michael Bloomberg became mayor of New York City, one of his priorities was to improve the level of service that city agencies provide to New Yorkers. His vision of "open government" involved instituting a "citizen service" mindset among the city's workers and establishing systems and processes by which residents could easily interact with City agencies to receive information, file complaints or resolve issues. The ultimate goal: improving the quality of life for New York's eight million citizens and hundreds of thousands of yearly visitors.

NYC 3-1-1 offers a broader range of services than many other cities because it adopted a model that encompassed all City non-emergency services, which includes an additional layer of complexity because of the borough and county structure within the city. Additionally, because it is often difficult for people to distinguish between City and State or Federal services, NYC 3-1-1 goes beyond NYC government by providing information and transferring to state and federal agencies when appropriate.

The 3-1-1 Citizen Service Center is replacing the many hotlines and call centers that used to handle citizens' requests and calls. Prior to 3-1-1, there were over 14 pages of NYC government phone numbers in phone book. Many of those numbers have been eliminated. To date, the operations of approximately 16 call centers have been consolidated into the 3-1-1 program. Each of these call centers utilized a variety of applications, telephony systems, and processes – most of which have been replaced or reengineered. Most agencies that are consolidated into 3-1-1 adopted the customer relationship management application that is utilized at the call center, which involves a partnering between 3-1-1 and the agency to adapt their business processes accordingly.

In addition to the public, 3-1-1 serves its partner agencies. Each agency that receives calls from 3-1-1 is assigned an analyst from DoITT's organization. These analysts work closely with agencies to ensure that content is up to date, new programs and services are included in 3-1-1, and that 3-1-1 is meeting the needs of the agency. Each agency's content is reviewed on a cyclical basis, and as new information is added to the system, it is checked through a quality assurance process. DoITT takes this relationship seriously, and continuously works to ensure that its clients are satisfied.

Finally, there has been an expansion of the capabilities within the services provided at 3-1-1. For example, DoITT developed a robust facility finder application that allows a 3-1-1 representative to find a service (such as a school, park, library, or clinic) at a location closest to the address of the caller. Working with the Department of Buildings, DoITT also built an appointment scheduling system that allows the caller to book an appointment (such as a Building Plan Review) by matching their availability against the open appointment slots for the type of meeting they are requesting. DoITT also developed an event calendar that allows caller to find out about events and activities in their neighborhood.

SUCCESS

The results of 3-1-1 have been remarkable. In the first 18 months of operations, 3-1-1 has received more than 13 million calls, and today the number of incoming calls average 40,000 per day. 3-1-1 has improved access to government, and allowed the City to have closer ties to its residents, businesses, and visitors. A recent 3-1-1 study revealed that 50 percent of citizens surveyed had called 3-1-1 regarding quality of life issues. 3-1-1 has also proven to be a valuable tool for managing communications during large-scale events. Following the August 2003 blackout, 3-1-1 answered over 175,000 calls, providing a critical link between the public and the City. Instead of overwhelming 911 with non-emergency calls about the outage, 3-1-1 was able to manage communications with the public, and keep 911 operators available to handle emergency calls. 3-1-1 has also played a critical role in other emergency situations such as the Staten Island Ferry Crash where 3-1-1 operators helped family members locate their missing relatives, and during a recent 911 outage when 3-1-1 was able to handle emergency calls while 911 services were being restored. Finally, in 2003, 911 handled 255,000 less calls than the previous year. This was the first decrease in 911 call volume in 13 years and is mainly attributed to the availability of 3-1-1.

The quality of service delivered to citizens has improved as well. As mentioned earlier, the information received from 3-1-1 quickly identified for the Department of Transportation that a harsh winter had created a large backlog of pothole complaints. Iris Weinshall, the transportation commissioner, dispatched an extra 150 workers to pothole duty, providing the department the ability to respond to pothole complaints in seven days—versus an average of 18 days prior to 3-1-1. This resulted in a reduction in the backlog of 66 percent. 3-1-1 recently expanded to support scheduling of field examinations with the Department of Buildings. Since implementation this has cut the time required to schedule an appointment from weeks to days.

Before 3-1-1 was implemented, the city established a baseline through a citizen survey. In February 2004 DoITT conducted another survey to assess the impact of 3-1-1. The findings were favorable and indicated that 3-1-1 was making a difference to people by saving them time, helping them find what they need, and improving how they view City government and its ability to help people. The survey results indicate the following benefits:

- People are interacting more with government – Citizens can sometimes be so overwhelmed by the complexity of government that they do not even try to seek help. New York's 3-1-1 service is making a difference. It has increased citizen interaction with government by simplifying the contact process itself. 3-1-1 has resulted in more contacts from citizens with questions related to City, state and federal services.
- People are being helped faster – Last year only 29 percent of people said that it took five minutes or less for the entire process of calling and obtaining help. With 3-1-1 that number has increased to 45 percent.
- People are receiving high-quality service – Over 80 percent of those who have used 3-1-1 agree that they found the information they needed, and that citizen service representatives are courteous and professional. 3-1-1 is giving New Yorkers easier access to City services.
- People believe that City government can help them – Overwhelming percentages of New Yorkers who have tried 3-1-1 agree: 3-1-1 has made access to information and services from government easier and faster. Perhaps most important, about three fourths of citizens now agree that New York City has fulfilled a key mission of 3-1-1: it has improved their view of how City government can help people.

The city is developing tools to further analyze data collected at 3-1-1 and produce metrics focused on client satisfaction. These include metrics such as:

- % of residents calling to access government services or information
- % of requests completed at end of first call
- Response time to service requests
- % of citizens satisfied with city services
- Success rate of resolving service requests

DIFFICULTY

While 3-1-1 is fully operational, DoITT continues to face challenges in operating and expanding the service. The most recent concern is continuing to meet the demand placed on the system by New Yorkers. The call volume to 3-1-1 has grown steadily since its inception, and the growth rate continues as new services are added. As individual programs are publicized, there is often a short-term spike in call volume. For instance, during the recent flu vaccine shortage and STAR tax rebate program call volume were as high as 110,000 calls in one day. Following these peaks, DoITT tends to experience a long-term growth in the daily average call volume – a sign that 3-1-1 callers are ‘sticky’ or tend to return to use the service after using it for the first time. While DoITT encourages New Yorkers to call 3-1-1, they want to make sure that they can continue to provide the same level of service provided on day one. That is why DoITT continues to train call takers to keep up with the volume, and explore new ways to handle calls more efficiently with the staff currently on hand.

A related issue is maintaining accurate up-to-date information in the knowledge base. Because of the complexity of range of services provided, DoITT needs to constantly be aware of what is going on in the city, as it will likely impact the calls received and the information DoITT needs to provide. To ensure that callers receive up to date information they have created a team focused on maintaining content that is in the system, as well as creating content for new programs and services.

The next biggest challenge is moving from a focus of providing information to the public to analyzing the information collected in order to improve government operations. This effort combines technology development with an in depth knowledge of government operations. The goal is to put in place an analytics capability that will allow for agency management, oversight, and open government. In order to implement this capability DoITT will need to face the business challenges of understanding what data is important to report upon, and the technology challenges of implementing a system that can report across multiple agencies’ systems and issues. There are two inherent difficulties in this effort. The first is the technical challenge of bringing together data from separate systems. The other challenge is in determining where new opportunities exist through joining data from multiple systems and multiple agencies. DoITT anticipates the planned analytics capability will help the city test hypotheses and identify causal relationships by bringing together more data than the city has had in one place before. Examples might be an analysis of whether flooded streets in March from water main breaks result in potholes in June, or a geographical comparison of quality of life complaints versus broken streetlights.

The need for an analytics capability extends to helping agencies better manage scarce resources to meet customer demand. The City is committed to continuing to improve the customer service experience for its citizens. However, as the accessibility of 3-1-1 may increase demand for certain City services, DoITT must provide ways to improve the speed and efficiency by which Agencies respond to requests. The availability of rich service demand and resolution data will help Agencies maximize their service fulfillment processes. The goal is to have customers see continuous improvements in the efficiency with which the City is able to resolve their complaints and fulfill their requests.